

**Before the
Federal Communications Commission
Washington, D.C. 20554**

2006 Quadrennial Regulatory Review –)	
Review of the Commission’s Broadcast)	
Ownership Rules and Other Rules Adopted)	MB Docket No. 06-121
Pursuant to Section 202 of the)	
Telecommunications Act of 1996)	
)	
2002 Biennial Regulatory Review)	MB Docket No. 02-277
)	
Cross-Ownership of Broadcast Stations and)	MM Docket No. 01-235
Newspapers)	
)	
Rules and Policies Concerning Multiple)	MM Docket No. 01-317
Ownership of Radio Broadcast Stations in)	
Local Markets)	
)	
Definition of Radio Markets)	MM Docket No. 00-244
)	
Ways to Further Section 257 Mandate and To)	MB Docket No. 04-228
Build on Earlier Studies)	

**FURTHER COMMENTS OF CONSUMERS UNION,
CONSUMER FEDERATION OF AMERICA AND FREE PRESS**

Gene Kimmelman
Vice President for Federal and
International Policy
Consumers Union
1101 17th Street, NW Suite 500
Washington, DC 20036
202-462-6262

Mark Cooper
Director of Research
Consumer Federation of America
1424 16th Street, NW Suite 310
Washington, DC 20036
301-384-2204

Ben Scott
Policy Director
Free Press
501 Third Street, NW, Suite 875
Washington, DC 20001
202-265-1490

October 22, 2007

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

PART I: THE FCC'S INADEQUATE, RESULTS DRIVEN RESEARCH AGENDA

INTRODUCTION

I. UNDERSTANDING AND MEASURING LOCALISM AND DIVERSITY

OVERVIEW OF THE ANALYSIS

OVERVIEW OF THE CHANGING RESEARCH FOCUS

Broadcast Localism

Other Shifts in Research Focus

A BROAD AND NUANCED DEFINITION OF BROADCAST LOCALISM

Conceptualizing Localism

Empirical Work

CONCLUSION: A MULTIFACETED, EMPIRICALLY-BASED

CONCEPT OF LOCALISM AND DIVERSITY

II. A NEW RESULTS-DRIVEN RESEARCH AGENDA

CHOOSING THE RESULTS FIRST

THE OVERALL APPROACH

Narrowing the Focus to Get Rid of the Rule

The Other Possibility

Identifying the Critical Number of Outlets

The Impact of Choosing a Low Threshold

ANALYZING MARKET STRUCTURE

ERRONEOUS ASSUMPTIONS AND EFFORTS TO MATCH THE SCIENCE

Study 1: Consolidation and Ownership Affect Competition, Localism and Diversity

Study 2: Media Usage

Study 3: News Operations

Study 4: Viewpoint Diversity

III. POLICY, PROCESS AND METHODOLOGICAL FLAWS IN THE FCC MEDIA OWNERSHIP RESEARCH

POLICY SUBSTANCE: THE FAILURE TO ADDRESS THE

IMPORTANT POLICY ISSUES
ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS
ANALYTIC METHODOLOGY
THE INSPECTOR GENERAL'S REPORT
TRANSPARENCY AND PUBLIC COMMENT

**PART II: DOING IT RIGHT AND FILLING THE GAPS: EXTRACTING GOOD
DATA FROM THE FCC'S BIASED RESEARCH FRAMEWORK**

INTRODUCTION

**IV. MARKET AND STATION LEVEL ANALYSIS WITH PROPERLY
DEFINED VARIABLES AND STATISTICAL MODELS**

OVERVIEW
SETTING UP THE ANALYSIS
RESULTS
Cross-Ownership
Concentration
Other Policy Variables

**V. TRADITIONAL MEDIA ARE STILL THE DOMINANT SOURCES OF
LOCAL NEWS AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS**

**THE IMPORTANCE OF MEDIA OUTLETS FOR LOCAL NEWS AND
INFORMATION**
THE USE OF MEDIA OUTLETS FOR LOCAL NEWS AND INFORMATION
TIME SPENT ON INFORMATION WITH VARIOUS MEDIA
**PROBIT MODELS OF MEDIA USAGE AND IMPORTANCE FOR LOCAL NEWS
AND INFORMATION**

**VI. THE LACK OF PRODUCTION OF LOCAL NEWS AND INFORMATION
BY ALTERNATIVE MEDIA OUTLETS**

**OVERVIEW: INDEPENDENT LOCAL NEWS WEB SITES LACK ORIGINAL
CONTENT AND DO NOT SIGNIFICANTLY CONTRIBUTE TO SOURCE
OR VIEWPOINT DIVERSITY**

BACKGROUND
NEWSPAPER ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA
Methodology
General Results – Qualitative

**General Results – Quantitative
The Bottom Line on Traditional Local Media Compared
To City-Specific Web Sites**

TAMPA MARKET ANALYSIS

Methodology

General Results – Qualitative

General Results – Quantitative

CHICAGO MARKET ANALYSIS

Methodology

General Results – Qualitative

General Results – Quantitative

CHICAGO BLOG DIRECTORIES

Methodology

General Results – Qualitative

General Results – Quantitative

CONCLUSION

VII. STATION REVENUES IN LARGE AND SMALL MARKETS

**EVEN-YEAR FINANCIAL DATA DOES NOT WITHSTAND SCRUTINY
STATION COMBINATION AND REVENUE**

PART III: CRITIQUE OF THE FCC STUDY METHODOLOGY

**VIII. ASSESSING THE METHODOLOGIES AND ROBUSTNESS OF
THE OFFICIAL CROSS-OWNERSHIP MEDIA STUDIES**

METHODOLOGICAL WEAKNESSES IN THE STATISTICAL STUDIES

Peer Reviewer Concerns

Additional Substantive Concerns

**Proper Specification of the Econometric Models Invalidates the
Conclusion that Cross-Owned Stations Air More Local
News**

**STUDY 3 - THE CONCLUSION THAT CROSS-OWNED STATIONS AIR MORE
LOCAL NEWS DOES NOT HOLD WHEN THE MODELS ARE PROPERLY
SPECIFIED**

**STUDY 4 - THE CONCLUSION THAT CROSS-OWNED STATIONS AIR MORE
NEWS DOES NOT HOLD WHEN THE MODELS ARE PROPERLY
SPECIFIED**

**STUDY 6 - PROPER SPECIFICATION INDICATES THAT CROSS-OWNED
STATIONS AIR FEWER SECONDS OF NON-SPORTS AND WEATHER
LOCAL NEWS**

CONCLUSION

IX. THE WEAKNESS OF “CONTENTLESS CONTENT ANALYSIS”: FLAWS IN THE METHODOLOGY FOR ANALYZING THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN MEDIA OWNERSHIP AND MEDIA BIAS

INTRODUCTION

THE APPROACH

A Measure of Media Bias

What Drives Media Slant

PROBLEM: MEANING

A Measure of Media Bias

What Drives Media Slant

PROBLEM: CATEGORIZATION AND SELECTION OF REFERENTS

A Measure of Media Bias

What Drives Media Slant

PROBLEM: SAMPLING OF CITATIONS

A Measure of Media Bias

What Drives Media Slant

PROBLEM: CREATION OF INDICES

A Measure of Media Bias

What Drives Media Slant

X. CRITIQUE OF DATA, DEFINITIONS AND ANALYSES

THE FLAWED CONTENTLESS CONTENT ANALYSIS OF STUDY 6

Non-Random Sampling

Meaning

Categorization and Selection of Referents

Creation of Indices

STUDY 4.1

The Key Variable is Mis-defined

Incomplete Discussion

STUDY 9

Introduction

Prime Time Programming

Cable Programming

Conclusion

**PART IV: THE FAILURE OF THE FCC TO FULLY ADDRESS AND
PROPERLY ANALYZE MINORITY AND DIVERSITY ISSUES**

**XI. THE COMMISSION HAS FAILED TO ADEQUATELY ACCOUNT FOR
THE TRUE LEVEL OF FEMALE AND MINORITY OWNERSHIP OF
FULL-POWER COMMERCIAL BROADCAST OUTLETS**

**INTRODUCTION: THE FAILURE TO PROPERLY ACCOUNT FOR AND
ANALYZE**

**MINORITY AND FEMALE OWNERSHIP ISSUES DESTROYS THE
VALIDITY OF ALL THE FCC'S RESEARCH
HISTORY AND BACKGROUND ON EFFORTS TO IDENTIFY MINORITY AND
FEMALE OWNERS OF BROADCAST OUTLETS
THE FAILURE OF THE FCC TO ACCURATELY COUNT MINORITY AND
FEMALE OWNERS OF BROADCAST OUTLETS**

**XII. THE COMMISSION HAS FAILED TO ASSESS THE IMPACT OF
CHANGES IN GENERAL POLICY ON MINORITY
AND FEMALE OWNERSHIP**

**ACCURATE DATA SHOW THAT RELAXING OWNERSHIP LIMITS REDUCES
MINORITY OWNERSHIP**

EVALUATION OF THE FCC MINORITY STUDIES

Study 7

Study 10

**XIII. MINORITY TARGETED PROGRAMMING:
STILL AT THE BACK OF THE BUS**

INTRODUCTION

THE FCC ANALYSIS OF MINORITY-TARGETED PROGRAMMING

BUILDING A LARGER DATABASE WITH CARRIAGE

Methodology

Results

Conclusion